

**Planning, Development, and Environmental Quality Committee**  
Regular Meeting Minutes – Approved 12-21-16  
Wednesday, November 16, 2016 3:00 PM  
Legislature Chambers

**Attendance**

<b>Attendee Name</b>	<b>Title</b>	<b>Status</b>
Martha Robertson	Chair	Present
Dooley Kiefer	Vice Chair	Present
Michael Sigler	Member	Present
David McKenna	Member	Present
James Dennis	Member	Present
Carol Chock	Member	Present
Anna Kelles	Member	Present
Katrina McCloy	Deputy Clerk	Present
Ed Marx	Planning Commissioner	Present
Katie Borgella	Deputy Planning Commissioner	Absent
Julia Mattick	Director, Workforce Development	Present
Diane Bradac	Director	Present
Megan McDonald	Senior Planner	Present
Fernando de Aragon	ITCTC Director	Present

Guests: Irene Weiser, Councilperson, Town of Caroline; Miranda Phillips and Nancy Jacobson, Citizens' Climate Lobby

**Call to Order**

Ms. Robertson, Chair, called the meeting to order at 3:01 p.m.

**Public Comment**

Irene Weiser, Town of Caroline, spoke in support of the resolution Urging United States Congress to Pass Carbon Fee and Dividend Legislation and stated she was glad to see the Committee considering this. She explained the different forms of carbon tax legislation being proposed throughout the country and said the version being presented is palatable and a step in the right direction.

**Changes to Agenda**

There were no changes to the agenda.

**Workforce Development**

**Resolution No. - Acceptance of Disability Resource Program Funding - Tompkins County Workforce Development Board (ID #6701)**

Ms. Robertson requested the memorandums attached to the resolutions be rewritten for clarity and include the time periods covered and positions being half-time.

<b>RESULT:</b>	<b>RECOMMENDED [UNANIMOUS]</b>
<b>MOVER:</b>	James Dennis, Member
<b>SECONDER:</b>	Anna Kelles, Member
<b>AYES:</b>	Robertson, Kiefer, Sigler, McKenna, Dennis, Chock, Kelles

WHEREAS, the Research Foundation for Mental Hygiene, Inc., in collaboration with the Social Security Administration made funding available for the implementation of a Disability Resource Coordinator position in the Tompkins Workforce New York Career Center in 2015, and

WHEREAS, this position provides guidance to individuals with disabilities on the myriad of services available to them, including individuals training accounts, connection to employers, expert information about the Social Security Administration’s work incentives and other employment support programs, and

WHEREAS, the activities are designed to integrate these services and dissemination of expert Social Security Administration employment support information into the State and local Career Center structure, and

WHEREAS, Challenge Workforce Solutions is the contractor providing the services of the Disability Resource Coordinator position in the Tompkins Workforce New York Career Center and the additional funding will be used to continue the contract for services, and

WHEREAS, no local funding is requested for this initiative, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, on recommendation of the Planning, Development, and Environmental Quality Committee, That the County hereby accepts the grant in the amount of \$15,917,

RESOLVED, further, That the Finance Director be and hereby is authorized and directed to make the following adjustment to the 2016 budget:

REVENUE:	CD6290.42070	Contributions from Private Agencies	\$ 15,917
APPROPRIATION:	CD6290.54491	Subcontracts	\$ 15,917

**SEQR ACTION: TYPE II-20**

\*\*\*\*\*

**Employment and Training**

**Resolution No. - Acceptance of Disability Resource Program Funding - Tompkins County Office of Employment and Training (ID #6703)**

<b>RESULT:</b>	<b>RECOMMENDED [UNANIMOUS]</b>
<b>MOVER:</b>	Anna Kelles, Member
<b>SECONDER:</b>	Carol Chock, Member
<b>AYES:</b>	Robertson, Kiefer, Sigler, McKenna, Dennis, Chock, Kelles

WHEREAS, the Research Foundation for Mental Hygiene, Inc., in collaboration with the Social Security Administration has made funding available for the time period July 11, 2016 - December 31, 2016, for a part-time Disability Resource Coordinator position in the Tompkins Workforce New York Career Center in 2016, and

WHEREAS, this position provides guidance to individuals with disabilities on the myriad of services available to them, including individuals training accounts, connection to employers, expert information about the Social Security Administration's work incentives and other employment support programs, and

WHEREAS, the activities are designed to integrate these services and dissemination of expert Social Security Administration employment support information into the State and local Career Center structure, and

WHEREAS, the funding will be used to fund a 0.5 FTE Workforce Development Specialist in the Tompkins County Office of Employment and Training to provide services to individuals with disabilities, and

WHEREAS, no local funding is requested for this initiative, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, on recommendation of the Planning, Development and Environmental Quality Committee, That the County hereby accepts the grant in the amount of \$22,507,

RESOLVED, further, That the Finance Director be and hereby is authorized and directed to make the following adjustment to the 2016 budget:

REVENUE:	CD6292.42070	Contributions from Private Agencies	\$22,507
APPROPRIATION:	CD6292.51000761	Workforce Development Specialist	\$11,360
	CD6292.58800	Fringe	\$ 5,193
	CD6292.54412	Travel/Training	\$ 2,450
	CD6292.54432	Rent	\$ 2,604
	CD6292.54414	Local Travel	\$ 900

**SEQR ACTION: TYPE II-20**

\* \* \* \* \*

**Planning**

**Resolution No. - Urging United States Congress to Pass Carbon Fee and Dividend Legislation (ID #6705)**

Minutes  
Planning, Development, and Environmental Quality Committee  
Wednesday, November 16, 2016

Ms. Jacobson explained the household impacts of the potential legislation could have and stated there were two independent studies completed regarding this. The first study from 2015 is "The impacts of a U.S. carbon tax across income groups and states" by Robertson C. Williams III, Dallas Burtraw, and Richard D. Morgenstern, all with Resources for the Future (RFF) can be found at <http://www.rff.org/research/publications/impacts-us-carbon-tax-across-income-groups-and-states>. This study shows that the lump sum rebate, or dividend, provides more benefits to lower income households. The second study is the Household Impact Study by Kevin Ummel and a two-page summary can be found at <https://11bup83sxdss1xe1i3lpol4-wpengine.netdna-ssl.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Household-Impacts-SUMMARY.pdf>. The full study, "The impact of CCL's proposed carbon fee and dividend policy: A high-resolution analysis of the financial effect on U.S. households", can be found at [https://11bup83sxdss1xe1i3lpol4-wpengine.netdna-ssl.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Ummel-Impact-of-CCL-CFD-Policy-v1\\_4.pdf](https://11bup83sxdss1xe1i3lpol4-wpengine.netdna-ssl.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/Ummel-Impact-of-CCL-CFD-Policy-v1_4.pdf) and shows the carbon footprints of individuals determines how much they will be affected by the rise in prices. The more direct or indirect fuels used by a person the more it will cost them. The study shows that 81% of the lowest income people will benefit the most.

Ms. Kiefer requested that the sources of information be documented in the resolution or at least attached to the resolution when it is included in the Legislature Agenda packet including who did the studies and what their credentials are. She objects to word dividend being used when it is a rebate. She inquired as to what energy sources are likely to grow instead of just stating it will stimulate sustainable green things.

Ms. Kiefer spoke of Environmental Management Council Resolution No. 01-2008 and suggested the following be incorporated into the version being presented:

“Resolved, That for these environmental, economic, and administrative reasons, the Tompkins County Environmental Management Council recommends that the Tompkins County Legislature declare its support for enactment of a federal carbon tax on importers and domestic extractors and refiners of fossil fuels, to be levied upstream in order to minimize the number of entities being directly taxed and the expense of monitoring compliance, with revenues directed to tax relief for low- and moderate-income households and financial support for conservation and sustainable energy programs, with public monitoring to assure compliance.”

Ms. Robertson suggested drafting a different version of the resolution presented by Citizens' Climate Lobby if that is the desire of the Committee.

Ms. Kelles stated she was supportive of this resolution. She did request further information to clarify why people will benefit more from this version of legislation be added as an attachment to the resolution prior to it being sent to the Legislature.

Mr. Sigler stated he was supportive of the term “dividend” being used because it sounds more like we are investing in this. He said he was ready to vote on this and this is not the legislation, instead this is a resolution supportive of the legislation.

Ms. Kelles would like to see a Whereas statement added to the resolution that states there are other countries that are already engaging in this type of legislation and how this would provide even footing while engaging in the world market. She spoke of a rebate versus dividend and stated it was technically a rebate because this involves paying something extra and receiving part of that back where a dividend is portion of the profit because someone is a shareholder. Ms. Phillips and Ms. Jacobson explained that the national movement for this calls it a dividend.

Ms. Chock said she was supportive of this resolution and would rather not table this. She believes now is not the time especially for those of us who would like to see legislation like this move forward and reward the companies that are taking advantage of renewable energy options. She would like to see the Tompkins County Legislature be one more voice in this national movement without trying to rewrite this. She applauds Citizens' Climate Lobby for taking these steps towards what can be achieved.

Ms. Phillips stated this resolution was presented and passed by the City of Ithaca's Common Council on November 2. The majority of the language written was drafted by City of Ithaca staff.

Ms. Chock suggested eliminating the first four whereas statements in the resolution and to replace them with "Whereas, the private market is actively building and marketing energy conservation products and renewable sources of energy".

Ms. Robertson suggested voting on this version of the resolution and work on a revised resolution that could be discussed through e-mail prior to a Special Committee meeting being held on December 6, 2016, before the Legislature meeting. She would like to see something added about the cost of disaster recovery.

Ms. Kiefer stated she was not ready to support this resolution because she believes it needs additional work.

Ms. Kelles agreed with Ms. Robertson's suggestions. Both she and Ms. Kiefer would like to see overwhelming support from Committee members.

Following discussion it was MOVED by Ms. Chock, seconded by Ms. Kiefer, to Table this resolution to December 6, 2016, at 4:45 p.m. for a different version to be presented. A voice vote to Table the resolution resulted as follows: Ayes - 3 (Legislators Chock, Kiefer, and McKenna); Noes - 4 (Legislators Dennis, Kelles, Robertson, and Sigler). MOTION FAILED.

Ms. Robertson requested a Word version of the resolution be sent to all Committee members by Mrs. McCloy. A Special Committee meeting was scheduled for December 6, 2016, at 4:45 p.m. to discuss a revised version of the resolution.

<b>RESULT:</b>	<b>RECOMMENDED [6 TO 1]</b>
<b>MOVER:</b>	James Dennis, Member
<b>SECONDER:</b>	Anna Kelles, Member
<b>AYES:</b>	Robertson, Sigler, McKenna, Dennis, Chock, Kelles
<b>NAYS:</b>	Kiefer

WHEREAS, climate scientists worldwide are in near-unanimous agreement that the planet Earth is warming rapidly and to a degree that is perilous to human civilization, to numerous species, and to the global ecosystem, and

WHEREAS, human activity is a significant contributor to global warming, especially through the accelerating combustion of fossil fuels that create carbon dioxide and other greenhouse gases as a byproduct, and

WHEREAS, the Tompkins County Legislature has a record of acknowledging the reality of climate change as well as the County's responsibility to reduce its contribution to the causes of global warming, as evidenced by the Tompkins County Comprehensive Plan, Tompkins County Energy Roadmap, Tompkins County Energy Strategy, and numerous greenhouse gas emissions inventories and climate action plans, and

WHEREAS, a prompt and major shift away from fossil fuels is a necessary cornerstone to any meaningful response to climate change, and

WHEREAS, a steadily increasing fee on fossil fuels at the point of their entry into the economy would be straightforward and make effective use of free-market mechanisms to promote the transition to greater energy conservation and renewable sources of energy, and

WHEREAS, this revenue-neutral carbon fee and dividend is an effective method to reduce carbon emissions for the following reasons:

- 1) The fee would motivate everyone to conserve and adopt renewable energy without the need for extensive governmental regulatory controls or infrastructure, encouraging consumers and the market to replace consumption of carbon-based energy with innovative, sustainable energy sources, whether by being more efficient or choosing other, less carbon intensive energy sources;
- 2) The fee would employ a market approach to encourage innovative processes, not only in energy production, but also in every field in which energy is consumed, e.g. electric cars, mass transportation, architectural planning and construction, water heating, lighting, and air conditioning in residential and commercial buildings;
- 3) Levying the fee at the point of production would be more efficient, less expensive and provide more accurate signals than would doing so at the point of consumption;
- 4) The fee would incentivize the development and use of alternative energies and attendant technologies, eliminating the need for government subsidies that attempt to forecast alternative energy winners and losers;
- 5) Because the fee is levied on the same basis on all businesses, it is fairer to every business and easier to administer than alternatives, such as a cap and trade system;
- 6) A border adjustment would assess a fee on goods traded with countries without a comparable carbon price, thereby maintaining the competitiveness of US businesses and discourage relocation to such countries, and

WHEREAS, such a policy would protect lower and middle-income households, as the dividend would allow more than 70% of American households to benefit financially, break even, or have only minimal increased costs (<0.2% income) from this policy; the policy would also create jobs, as the dividend puts money back into local economies, and

WHEREAS, further delay in responding to this crisis increases the risk of catastrophic climate change, imminently threatens low-lying coastal areas and land and sea species, threatens water supplies, increases the frequency of severe weather events, increases the cost of undertaking adequate responses, and increases risks to the global economy, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, on recommendation of the Planning, Development and Environmental Quality Committee, That the Tompkins County Legislature endorses a carbon fee and dividend and urges our representatives in the United States Congress to enact it into law.

**SEQR ACTION:** Not an action subject to SEQR

\* \* \* \* \*

**Resolution No. - Budget Adjustments - Various Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) Activities through the Use of Grant Funds and Program Income Generated from Previous CDBG Grants (ID #6699)**

It was MOVED by Mr. Sigler, seconded by Mr. Dennis, to Call the Question.

A voice vote on the motion to Call the Question resulted as follows: Ayes - 4 (Legislators Dennis, Kelles, McKenna, and Sigler); Noes - 3 (Legislators Chock, Kiefer, and Robertson). THE QUESTION WAS CALLED.

<b>RESULT:</b>	<b>RECOMMENDED [UNANIMOUS]</b>
<b>MOVER:</b>	James Dennis, Member
<b>SECONDER:</b>	Dooley Kiefer, Vice Chair
<b>AYES:</b>	Robertson, Kiefer, Sigler, McKenna, Dennis, Chock, Kelles

WHEREAS, pursuant to Administrative Manual Policy 05-02, budget adjustments exceeding \$5,000 require Legislative approval, and

WHEREAS, the Tompkins County Planning Department has received funding from several multi-year Community Development Block Grants (CDBG) grants in 2014, 2015, and 2016, and

WHEREAS, the Tompkins County Planning Department has Program Income Funds that are generated from the repayment of loans from previous CDBG-funded Tompkins County Homeownership Program loans, and

WHEREAS, Tompkins County, with the approval of the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD), uses Program Income Funds for its contributions to the Community Housing Development Fund, and

WHEREAS, the Tompkins County Legislature has previously approved the Homeownership, Tompkins County Healthy Homes Rehabilitation II, and Community Housing Development Fund activities, and

WHEREAS, as a result of the multi-year grants, Program Income revenue, and delays in Community Housing Development Fund projects, several budget adjustments to the 2016 budget are needed to move the funds into the appropriate fiscal year for these activities, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, on recommendation of the Planning, Development, and Environmental Quality Committee, That the Director of Finance be and is hereby authorized and directed to make the following budget adjustments for 2016:

	Revenue	Title	Amount	Appropriation	Title	Amount
State CDBG Grants	8688.44959	Federal Aid	\$1,014,000	8688.54400	Program Expense	\$1,014,000
State CDBG Program Income	8684.42411	Program Income	\$177,800	8684.54400	Program Expense	\$90,000

HUD CDBG Program Income <i>(to match monthly revenue coming in)</i>	8695.42411	Program Income	\$189,000
	8695.54400	Program Expense	\$200,000
		<i>BA in 2015 paid in 2016 (RESO 2015-233)</i>	

**SEQR ACTION: TYPE II-20**

\* \* \* \* \*

**Resolution No. - Making a Negative Declaration of Environmental Significance in Relation to Resolution No. Of 2016: Authorizing the Implementation of the 2016 Stream Corridor Restoration and Flood Hazard Mitigation Program Projects (ID #6704)**

It was MOVED by Ms. Kelles, seconded by Mr. Dennis, to Call the Question.

A voice vote on the motion to Call the Question resulted as follows: Ayes - 5 (Legislators Dennis, Kelles, McKenna, Robertson, and Sigler); Noes - 2 (Legislators Chock and Kiefer). THE QUESTION WAS CALLED.

Ms. Kiefer requested the minutes reflect the fact that the Short Environmental Assessment Form indicated the proposed action was located in an archeological sensitive area (per question 12. b.) but the exact location has not been disclosed by the State Historic Preservation Office (SHIPO).

<b>RESULT:</b>	<b>RECOMMENDED [6 TO 1]</b>
<b>MOVER:</b>	Martha Robertson, Carol Chock
<b>SECONDER:</b>	Anna Kelles, Member
<b>AYES:</b>	Robertson, Sigler, McKenna, Dennis, Chock, Kelles
<b>NAYS:</b>	Kiefer

WHEREAS, in Resolution No. \_\_\_ of 2016, the Tompkins County Legislature would authorize the County Administrator or his designee to implement the 2016 Stream Corridor Restoration and Flood Hazard Mitigation Program, and would also authorize execution of contracts necessary for the County to implement the projects funded through this program, and

WHEREAS, the Technical Committee for the Stream Corridor Restoration and Flood Hazard Mitigation Program has identified three distinct projects consisting of the Brown Road Feasibility Study, the Cayuga Inlet Sediment Assessment Project and the Freeville-Fall Creek Stream Buffer Revegetation Project, to be funded through the Stream Corridor and Flood Hazard Mitigation Program, and

WHEREAS, the Tompkins County Legislature has reviewed and accepted as adequate an Environmental Assessment Forms with respect to that action, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, on recommendation of the Planning, Development, and Environmental Quality Committee, That Resolution No. \_\_\_ of 2016 is an unlisted action,

RESOLVED, further, That the County Legislature hereby makes a negative declaration of environmental significance in regard to Resolution No. \_\_\_ of 2016.

**SEQR ACTION:** UNLISTED (Short EAF on file)  
\* \* \* \* \*

**Resolution No. - Authorizing the Implementation of the 2016 Stream Corridor Restoration and Flood Hazard Mitigation Program Projects (ID #6706)**

<b>RESULT:</b>	<b>RECOMMENDED [UNANIMOUS]</b>
<b>MOVER:</b>	James Dennis, Member
<b>SECONDER:</b>	Anna Kelles, Member
<b>AYES:</b>	Robertson, Kiefer, Sigler, McKenna, Dennis, Chock, Kelles

WHEREAS, the Tompkins County Legislature re-established the Stream Corridor Restoration and Flood Hazard Mitigation Program in 2006, and

WHEREAS, the Tompkins County Legislature provided funding for the Flood Hazard Mitigation Program in the amount of \$25,000 in 2016, and

WHEREAS, the Technical Committee for the Stream Corridor Restoration and Flood Hazard Mitigation Program has identified three distinct projects consisting of the Brown Road Feasibility Study, the Cayuga Inlet Sediment Assessment Project and the Freeville-Fall Creek Stream Buffer Revegetation Project, to be funded through the Stream Corridor and Flood Hazard Mitigation Program, and

WHEREAS, the Tompkins County Legislature has reviewed and accepted as adequate the Environmental Assessment Form for the project categorized as an Unlisted action, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, on recommendation of the Planning, Development, and Environmental Quality Committee, That the County Administrator or his designee be and hereby is authorized to execute agreements necessary for the County to implement the projects funded by the Stream Corridor Restoration and Flood Hazard Mitigation Program.

**SEQR ACTION:** TYPE II-21 (Brown Road Feasibility Study), TYPE II-18 (Cayuga Inlet Sediment Assessment Project) and Unlisted (Freeville-Fall Creek Stream Buffer Revegetation) (Short EAF on file in the office of the Clerk of the Legislature)  
\* \* \* \* \*

**Advisory Board Appointment(s) (ID #6708)**

<b>RESULT:</b>	<b>RECOMMENDED [UNANIMOUS]</b>
<b>MOVER:</b>	Anna Kelles, Member
<b>SECONDER:</b>	Carol Chock, Member
<b>AYES:</b>	Robertson, Kiefer, Sigler, McKenna, Dennis, Chock, Kelles

Environmental Management Council - term expires December 31, 2018  
Thomas Shelley - City of Ithaca representative

Planning Advisory Board

Minutes  
Planning, Development, and Environmental Quality Committee  
Wednesday, November 16, 2016

David A. Herrick - Infrastructure/Utilities representative; term expires December 31, 2019

Tompkins Consolidated Area Transit Board of Directors  
Daniel Klein - County Legislator; term expires December 31, 2019

**Minutes Approval**

October 19, 2016

<b>RESULT:</b>	<b>ACCEPTED [5 TO 2]</b>
<b>MOVER:</b>	Anna Kelles, Member
<b>SECONDER:</b>	James Dennis, Member
<b>AYES:</b>	Robertson, Sigler, McKenna, Dennis, Kelles
<b>NAYS:</b>	Kiefer, Chock

**Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned at 4:52 p.m.